Trope theory is a metaphysical school of thought elucidated in its modern form by Donald Cary Williams in the mid-twentieth century. It navigates the distinction and status of universals and particulars through the language of set theory on abstract entities. Tropes have previously been noted for their similarity to phenomenological and pragmatic concepts. This paper argues that these mutual similarities derive from a shared indebtedness to Hermann Lotze’s *Logic*, and that Williams is recasting these ideas with more contemporary mathematical and philosophical frameworks. We offer a close-read of the *Logic* and *On the Elements of Being*, combined with historical connections, to show that the intersection of phenomenology, pragmatism, process philosophy, and analytic philosophy owes a lot to Lotze’s third way “idealism-realism” and its transmission and transmutation across generations through individuals like Husserl, Royce, Santayana, Whitehead, and Williams.